

SHARED ETHICS ADVISORY COMMISSION

Composite Report on 2012 Employee Ethics Survey

The Commission is very pleased that 565 full-time municipal employees out of a total of 1285 (44%) took the time and had sufficient interest to complete our twelve question ethics survey, a blank copy of which is in Tab 1. This substantial response indicates a high interest in ethical issues and is also an indication that the leadership in our member communities share their employees interest in ethical practices and ethical decision-making.

The following general conclusions are drawn from the composite responses from all 565 respondents. The composite results often (but not always) mirror responses from individual communities. Where there are differences, they are sometimes significant. A chart following this written summary shows the results for each survey question on a composite basis and also for each member community. Tabs 3 through 9 contain community-specific information for each participating community. Following each of these summaries is a chart reporting that community's responses and comparing them to the Composite group.

Set out in this Tab 2 are reflections on the aggregated responses from all seven communities. These results give a broad overview of how municipal employees feel about certain aspects of ethics in local government. These aggregate results also provide a basis for comparing responses from each member community.

2012 Composite Conclusions/Observations

- 1 Municipal Employees Value Ethics Training. Sixty seven percent (67%) of both trained and untrained employees rated ethics training as important or very important. Such a large positive response from both trained and untrained indicates the value employees attach to learning about ethical decision-making. We believe that **untrained** employees are saying they want training and that **trained** employees seem to be indicating they were pleased to have had training and perhaps would like more.
- 2 Training Increases Employee Awareness of Ethics. For the following two survey questions, the differences between trained and untrained employees were statistically significant:
 - Awareness of the Commission's Code of Shared Ethics and Values was 78 percent for trained employees and only 43 percent among untrained.
 - Knowledge of the procedure for reporting a possible ethical violation was 77 percent among trained and only 41 percent among untrained.

Bottom line: For these questions, training makes a difference.

- 3 Trained Employees Have More Confidence in Their Communities' Procedures for Handling Reports of Ethics Violations. Here again, there are statistically significant differences for two additional questions:
 - When asked if ethics violations were reported, would someone take action, 72 percent of trained employees checked yes compared to 53 percent who were untrained.
 - And when asked if the action taken would be fair and appropriate, 65 percent trained employees said yes versus only 45 percent of the untrained.

So again: We can say training has a positive impact.

- 4 Trained Employees May Have A Better Understanding Of What Constitutes Unethical Behavior. When asked if they have witnessed unethical behavior, only 38 percent of the trained said they had while 49 percent of the untrained answered yes. One possible explanation may be that trained employees have a deeper understanding of what constitutes unethical behavior. It is also possible that untrained employees may be quick to feel any decision or action they do not like or agree with is “unethical.” Whatever the reasons, the difference between trained and untrained is significant.
- 5 Employees Continue to Express Concern About Misuse of Public Resources, Conflicts of Interest and Favoritism. Of the three concerns, conflicts of interest was chosen less often (trained-42%, untrained-49%). Favoritism was of greater concern among untrained employees (65%) than trained (53%). One possible reason for this difference could be a fuller understanding by trained employees of what constitutes favoritism. Nevertheless, a majority of both trained and untrained employees expressed concern about favoritism. Concern is also expressed by both trained and untrained about misuse of public resources (trained - 53%; untrained - 43%).
- 6 Ethics Training is Having a Positive Impact. The statistically significant differences between trained and untrained employees in responses to several survey questions indicates that employees can grow and are in fact growing in their awareness of issues and procedures concerning ethics in government.
7. However, We See a Possible Paradox in Responses to the Questions about Actually Reporting Ethics Violations. While 83 percent of the trained and 77 percent of the untrained say they **would** report an ethics violation, only 21 percent of the trained and 23 percent of the untrained have actually reported unethical behavior. One possible explanation is that there just are not that many infractions. Another, less optimistic, explanation might be that while they would like to think they would report, when faced with the actual situation, they may decide not to do so for various reasons – don’t want to “rock the boat,” friendships might be involved, fear of unknown consequences, etc.

Composite 2012 Compared to 2009

The accompanying chart also provides comparative data for the two times the survey has been administered. In most categories, between 2009 and 2012, percentages increased where we would want them to and declined where that was the preferred result. One difficulty in interpreting these results arises from the fact nearly half of the 2012 respondents are from new communities that had not conducted Commission-sponsored training at the time the survey was taken. If employees of the two new communities (Dyer and East Chicago) are removed from the total response of 565, the remaining communities together produced 295 employee responses compared to 307 responses in the 2009 survey. This modest decline may represent a reduction in the size of the workforce in some or all of those member communities.

1 Positive Changes since 2009

- Both trained and untrained were (a) more aware of the Code of Shared Ethics and Values, (b) felt training was important or very important, (c) know how to report an ethics complaint, and (d) say they would report a violation. (On

this last point, the percentage of untrained answering yes dropped just slightly – 80 percent in 2009; 77 percent in 2012, but both percentages are very high)

- Among trained and untrained employees the percentage of those who thought they saw unethical behavior declined dramatically. Perhaps training gave them a deeper understanding of what constitutes unethical behavior. This may also account for the significant decrease in both trained and untrained saying they have actually reported unethical behavior. It should be noted that the 2012 question asked if unethical behavior was witnessed in the past twelve months. The 2009 question had no time limit.
- A lower percentage of both trained and untrained asked for advice and hopefully this is because training increased their own knowledge and the knowledge of their co-workers so that supervisors did not need to be asked. Fewer occurrences of perceived violations may also account for this decline.
- Both trained and untrained expressed less concern in 2012 about favoritism and conflicts of interest (though those percentages are still relatively high).

2. **Mixed Changes** since 2009

- The percentage of **trained** employees who felt action would be taken if a complaint were filed and that this action would be fair and appropriate remained almost the same as in 2009. However, there was a decline in both percentages for the **untrained**.
- Misuse of public resources among **trained** employees remained the same. Fifty-three percent of trained employees continued to express concern. However, among the untrained, the percentage dropped significantly from 54 percent to 43 percent.

Recommendations

- 1 Continue training on a regular basis and perhaps give it additional emphasis. The slight decline in responses between 2009 and 2012 may or may not be significant, but it is a reminder that continuous effort is needed to prevent a loss of enthusiasm for the ethics in government effort.
- 2 To further enhance the effectiveness of training, make sure training includes information on that particular community's specific procedure for filing and processing ethics complaints.
- 3 The comparison with 2009 survey results indicates several positive results that tend to validate ethics training.
- 4 Because of continuing concern expressed by survey respondents, make sure training addresses issues of misuse of public resources, conflicts of interest and favoritism.
5. Lead by example. As a minimum, all elected officials, members of boards and commissioners, and department head and supervisors should also participate in Commission-sponsored training and continually promote an ethical culture.

2012 and 2009 Comparison of Trained vs. Untrained Employees In Each Community

Shaded figures are from 2009. White background are from 2012.

Community Number Responding	Composite 565		Crown Point 90		Dyer 52		East Chicago 218		Highland 45		Munster 53		Schererville 42		Whiting 65	
	307		64						59		60		69		55	
Question	Trained (155)	U/T (410)	Trained (26)	U/T (64)	Trained (7)	U/T (45)	Trained (12)	U/T (206)	Trained (30)	U/T (15)	Trained (21)	U/T (32)	Trained (17)	U/T (25)	Trained (42)	U/T (23)
1. Percent aware of the Ethics Code	78	43	73	52	71	41	83	27	73	63	60	63	88	36	88	71
	69	36	73	33					59	52	82	47	26	38	88	18
2. Percent trained on ethics in last 12 months/ever			29	71	14	86	6	94	33	67	38	62	39	61	65	35
	--	--														
3. Percent saying ethics training is important or very important	48	52	63	37					47	53	75	25	28	72	29	71
	67	67	54	57	71	52	83	77	64	60	75	75	74	60	63	66
4. Percent who witnessed unethical behavior in the last 12 months/ever	61	61	59	59					61	61	57	57	58	58	72	72
	38	49	58	49	14	49	25	47	60	60	30	63	31	40	32	46
5. Percent who know how to report unethical behavior	66	63	68	58					70	53	67	53	53	68	69	69
	77	41	69	54	57	33	64	35	67	57	75	50	88	32	90	55
6. Percent who asked for advice on ethics																
	72	26	78	29					63	10	69	33	63	36	94	21
7. Percent who have reported unethical behavior	22	18	15	16	14	7	25	18	27	27	10	34	25	20	29	9
	45	26	33	18					52	17	49	20	47	39	47	23
8. Percent who would report such	21	23	23	21	0	13	42	26	47	37	20	28	33	8	2	18
	53	41	33	18					52	20	36	27	41	33	25	32
8. Percent who would report such	83	77	81	71	71	67	92	81	87	90	80	66	100	74	76	80

behavior	79	80	77	82					88	89	76	75	77	77	81	77
9. Percent who felt corrective action would be taken	72	53	54	44	86	51	67	57	67	43	90	40	71	65	78	59
	71	64	69	64					64	59	67	62	82	72		
10. Percent who felt action would be fair and appropriate	65	45	46	40	86	49	58	48	53	38	74	30	62	50	78	55
	66	58	63	59					48	54	65	53	77	67	88	53
11. Ethics Issues of concern: -misuse of public resource	53	43	50	43	29	31	58	47	67	43	40	47	63	40	54	23
	53	54	50	71					41	48	51	62	70	50	80	53
-favoritism	53	65	58	62	29	49	50	70	73	67	55	78	56	60	46	55
	64	73	65	79					55	70	74	92	60	65	40	73
-Conflicts of Interest	42	49	46	41	29	62	50	50	60	50	40	59	44	40	32	36
	53	58	62	50					50	74	46	62	60	53	60	53
-Other	11	17	15	14	14	7	17	20	13	27	10	19	19	16	2	14
	13	15	8	0					23	15	13	23	10	15	0	7

2012 Crown Point Report

Several survey responses from Crown Point employees are similar to the Composite figures. However, there are also some questions in which Crown Point employees' answers differ from the Composite and, in some cases, the difference is significant. The Composite percentages represent an aggregation of responses from all seven communities that participated in the survey and provide a baseline comparison for Crown Point responses. The accompanying chart compares composite results (including Crown Point) with Crown Point only responses. Altogether, ninety city employees returned the survey. Some of the differences include:

1. Crown Point employees, both trained and untrained, were less positive about the importance of ethics training. It should be noted, however, that a majority of trained (54%) and untrained (57%) still thought ethics training was important or very important, but Crown Point responses are much lower than the 67% of the Composite group.
2. Trained Crown Point employees (58%) reported witnessing a significantly higher percentage of unethical behavior than the Composite group (38%). The response of Crown Point's untrained employees to the same question (49 percent) exactly matched the Composite group.
3. **Trained** Crown Point employees are below the Composite group in knowing how to report alleged violations (69% compared to 77%). The same is true when it comes to asking for advice (Composite trained 22% compared to 15% Crown Point). **Untrained** employees are close to the Composite for both questions (16% compared to 18%).
4. On a positive note, **trained** Crown Point employees are slightly better than the Composite group in reporting violations (21% Composite compared to 23% Crown Point). Trained and untrained Crown Point employees are very close to the Composite group in saying they would report if they saw what they thought was a violation. (Composite trained/untrained 83% / 77% compared to 81% / 71% for Crown Point).

Crown Point 2012 Compared to 2009

In some important respects Crown Point employee responses in 2012 provide encouraging result when compared to the 2009 survey:

- Seventy three percent of trained employees in both time periods continue to be aware of the Code of Shared Ethics and Values. Meanwhile, the percentage of untrained knowing about the Code has increased substantially – 33% in 2009; 52% in 2012. Perhaps, trained employees have mentioned the Code to their co-workers or they have seen other references to the Code.
- Those witnessing alleged unethical behavior in 2012, both trained (58%) and untrained (49%) were lower than the 2009 survey (68% and 58% respectively).
- In 2012 only about 15 percent of the trained and 16 percent of the untrained reported asking supervisors for advice about ethics issues while the 2009 percentage among untrained is about the same (18%). Trained employees were at 33% in 2009.

- Consistent with the previous bullet points, **trained** employees who say they have reported ethics violations declined (23% in 2012 compared to 33% in 2009). One explanation is that there were simply fewer perceived infractions to report in 2012. Among the **untrained**, the percentage saying they have reported remained nearly the same – 21% in 2012; 18% in 2009.
- In the 2012 survey 81 percent of **trained** employees said they would report an ethics violation if they saw one compared to 77 percent in 2009. A substantial percentage of **untrained** employees said they would also likely report – 71 percent saying they would, but that is down from 82 percent in 2009.
- While a considerable percentage of employees continue to express concern about misuse of public resources, favoritism and conflicts of interest, the percentage of **trained** employees expressing concerns about favoritism and conflicts has declined significantly compared to the 2009 (although still above the Composite group). With respect to misuse of public resources, the percentage was the same in both surveys (50%).

Somewhat tempering these positives, however, are responses to several other questions which showed a negative trend between 2012 and 2009.

- There was a decline in the percentage of employees feeling ethics training was important or very important. Fortunately, the 2012 favorable percentage for both trained and untrained is still over 50 percent (54% for trained and 57% for untrained) but less strong compared to 2009 when both trained and untrained percentages stood at 59 percent.
- The percent of **trained** employees saying they know how to report ethics complaints declined in 2012 (69%) compared to in 2009 (78%). The opposite occurred with the **untrained** – 54 percent said they now know how to file a complaint compared to only 29 percent in 2009.
- Employees seem to have less confidence with enforcement issues. Questioned about corrective action being taken if a complaint is filed produced significantly lower percentages in 2012. **Trained** - 2009 at 69%; 2012 at 54%; **Untrained** - 2009 at 64%; 2012 at 44%.
- Similarly on the question of whether the corrective action would be fair and appropriate, only 46 percent of the 2012 **trained** employees said yes compared to 63 percent in the 2009 survey. **Untrained** employees showed the same trend – 40% in 2012; 59% in 2009.

Perhaps impacting the less favorable result to several of the 2012 questions is the low percentage of employees reporting that they had been trained in the past 12 months – 29% compared to 63% in the 2009 survey.

Recommendations

1. The low percentage (just 29%) of employees saying they had received training in the past 12 months strongly suggests that they and their untrained co-workers should receive additional training in the very near future.
2. While a majority of respondents thought ethics training is important, the level of enthusiasm is lower than other communities and also lower than it was in 2009. Perhaps greater attention to and emphasis on quality ethics training would improve responses to this question.

3. Employees seem to see a higher level of unethical behavior than the Composite group even though there has been a considerable decline from the 2009 survey. One way to address this issue would be to give greater emphasis in Crown Point training to what actually is unethical. Sometimes employees assume whatever they disagree with must be unethical. Perception is not always reality.
4. Training for Crown Point employees may need to emphasize Crown Point-specific procedures for filing ethics complaints. Responding employees were less likely to be familiar with those procedures or to ask a supervisor for advice than the Composite group. However, the 2012 percentages are an improvement over the 2009 results.
5. Enforcement issues also need added attention. The percentage of **trained** employees who thought a complaint would be acted on (54% in 2012 survey) was lower than 2009 (69%) and also lower than the 2012 Composite group (72%). **Untrained** employees responses showed a similar pattern. With respect to the other enforcement question – would the response be fair and reasonable, **trained** Crown Point employees’ “Yes” percentage (46%) was significantly below 2009 (63%) and also significantly less than the 2012 Composite (65%). A similar pattern exist for the untrained.
6. Trained employees expressed a bit more concern about conflicts than the Composite group. This may be an issue of perception that can probably be addressed by more focus on the issue during ethics training. Here again, the 2012 results are an improvement over 2009.

Comparison of Trained vs. Untrained Employees In Each Community

Community Number Responding	2012 Composite 565		2012 Crown Point 90		2009 Crown Point 64	
	Trained 155	U/T 410	Trained 26	U/T 64	Trained 40	U/T 24
Question						
1. Percent aware of the Ethics Code	78	43	73	52	73	33
2. Percent trained on ethics in last 12 months			29	71	63	37
3. Percent saying ethics training is important or very important	67	67	54	57	59	59
4. Percent who witnessed unethical behavior in the last 12 months	38	49	58	49	68	58
5. Percent who know how to report unethical behavior	77	41	69	54	78	29
6. Percent who asked for advice on ethics	22	18	15	16	33	18
7. Percent who have reported unethical behavior	21	23	23	21	33	18
8. Percent who would report such behavior	83	77	81	71	77	82
9. Percent who felt corrective action would be taken	72	53	54	44	69	64

<u>Community Number Responding</u>	<u>2012 Composite 565</u>		<u>2012 Crown Point 90</u>		<u>2009 Crown Point 64</u>	
	Trained 155	U/T 410	Trained 26	U/T 64	Trained 40	U/T 24
10. Percent who felt action would be fair and appropriate	65	45	46	40	63	59
11. Ethics Issues of concern:						
• Misuse of public resource	53	43	50	43	50	71
• Conflicts of Interest	53	65	58	62	65	79
• Favoritism	42	49	46	41	62	50
• Other	11	17	15	14	8	0

2012 Dyer Report

As a new community to the Commission, Dyer employees had not yet had a chance to conduct training at the time the survey was taken. Since only 7 of Dyer's 52 respondents had received ethics training in the past year, the results for the "trained" should be interpreted with considerable care. Statisticians warn that it is not appropriate to draw conclusions from small sample sizes. On the other hand, the results for the "untrained," based on 45 respondents, can be interpreted with confidence. In what follows, the responses of the Dyer employees are compared to the Composite group which is the combined responses of the trained and untrained employees from all seven communities that participated in the survey. Attached is a complete report of Dyer's response compared to the composite group.

1. Untrained Dyer employees (the vast majority of the respondents) indicated a lower interest in ethics training than the Composite group. Sixty-seven percent of the Composite group's untrained employees indicated that ethics training was important or very important whereas untrained Dyer respondents were at only 52 percent. This may indicate that some Dyer employees do not know what to expect from the training. Whatever the reason, prompt attention to providing training for all employees should have a positive effect. Seventy-one percent of the few employees who have been trained rated ethics training as important or very important. This exceeds the Composite figure for trained employees (67%).
2. In several categories, Dyer's responses were more favorable than the Composite group. For example, fewer of Dyer's **trained** employees say they have witnessed unethical behavior (Dyer 14% to Composite 38%). However, Dyer **untrained** had the same response as the Composite with 49 percent of both groupings saying they had witnessed unethical behavior.
3. There was a higher percentage of **trained** Dyer employees who felt:
 - (a) that action would be taken when possible violations were reported. **Untrained** employees were close to the Composite results (Composite trained/untrained – 72%/53%; Dyer trained/untrained – 86%/51%) and
 - (b) that the action would be fair and appropriate (Composite - 65%/45%; Dyer-86%/49%). These positive results may indicate effective administration of town policies.
4. When it comes to misuse of public resources and favoritism, Dyer employees express much less concern than those of the Composite communities. Misuse of public resources: Composite trained/untrained – 53%/43%; Dyer- 29%/31%. Favoritism: Composite trained/untrained 53%/65%; Dyer-29%/49%).
5. However, on the issue of conflicts of interest, **untrained** Dyer employees (45 of the 52 respondents) had a greater concern than the Composite group (Composite-49%; Dyer-62%). For the seven employees who had been trained, the results were just the opposite with **trained** Dyer employees expressing much less concern about favoritism (29%) compared to the Composite group (42%). Perhaps their ethics training gave these seven employees a better understanding of what constitutes conflicts.

6. Dyer employees report a lower percentage knowing how to report unethical behavior (Composite trained/untrained-77%/41%; Dyer-57%/33%). Not surprising since formal ethics training had not yet begun in Dyer at the time the survey was taken.

Note: Dyer was not a Commission member in 2009. Consequently, the attached chart only compares Dyer's 2012 results to the Composite results.

Recommendations

1. All Dyer employees should receive ethics training as soon as possible.
2. Because of possible skepticism about the value of ethics training, it is particularly important that the training provided be of high quality. (Recent evaluations from Dyer employees, who were trained after the survey was taken, seem to indicate their satisfaction with the training that was provided.)
3. Training should include specific information on Dyer procedures for reporting alleged ethical violation since many respondents indicated they are not familiar with the procedure.
4. Since there was a high expressed concern about conflicts of interest, training should address this issue with extra care. Perhaps this is an issue of perception that may be effectively addressed by focused training on what constitutes conflicts versus an outcome that the employee simply disagrees with.

<u>Community Number Responding</u>	<u>Composite 565</u>		<u>Dyer 52</u>	
	Trained 155	U/T 410	Trained 7	U/T 45
1. Percent aware of the Ethics Code	78	43	71	41
2. Percent trained on ethics in last 12 months			14	86
3. Percent saying ethics training is important or very important	67	67	71	52
4. Percent who witnessed unethical behavior in the last 12 months	38	49	14	49
5. Percent who know how to report unethical behavior	77	41	57	33
6. Percent who asked for advice on ethics	22	18	14	7
7. Percent who have reported unethical behavior	21	23	0	13
8. Percent who would report such behavior	83	77	71	67
9. Percent who felt corrective action would be taken	72	53	86	51

Community Number Responding	Composite 565		Dyer 52	
	Trained 155	U/T 410	Trained 7	U/T 45
10. Percent who felt action would be fair and appropriate	65	45	86	49
11. Ethics Issues of concern:				
• Misuse of public resource	53	43	29	31
• Conflicts of Interest	53	65	29	49
• Favoritism	42	49	29	62
• Other	11	17	14	7

2012
East Chicago Report

As a new community to the Commission, East Chicago employees had not yet had a chance to experience widespread ethics training at the time the survey was taken. Only 12 of the 218 respondents reported having had some ethics training. Consequently, this summary gives most attention to responses from **untrained** employees compared to the same category from the Composite group. Composite figures consist of an aggregation of the responses from all seven communities that participated in the survey. Attached is a complete report of East Chicago's responses compared to the Composite group. Some highlights include:

1. East Chicago employees indicated a very high interest in ethics training (77% compared to 67% in the Composite calculation).
2. In other categories – witnessing unethical behavior, having asked for advice on ethical issues, having reported unethical behavior – untrained East Chicago employees were generally in line with the Composite number. But, since nearly all East Chicago employees are untrained, these percentages indicate that training is needed in order to move East Chicago percentages closer to those of Composite trained, particularly with emphasis on how to report and process ethics complaints.
3. East Chicago employees express a high concern about favoritism (70%). Consequently, this would be a good issue to address with an added focus during training.

Note: East Chicago was not a Commission member in 2009. Consequently, the attached chart only compares East Chicago's 2012 results to the Composite results.

Recommendations

1. East Chicago employees and leaders are to be commended for the very large number of survey responses, 218 in all, by far the largest number of any community. We take this as a sign of employee enthusiasm and also City leadership's commitment to ethics training.
2. A strategy should be developed and implemented to promptly train all East Chicago employees. This will be "first impression" training for almost all City employees; so particular attention is needed to the quality of the training. The Commission recognizes the logistical challenges presented in training the City's large workforce and is willing to assist in the effort.
3. Training should include specific information on how to file an ethics complaint and what procedures will be followed once the complaint is filed. Less than a majority (48%) currently feel that complaints will produce a fair and appropriate response. This discomfort needs to be overcome for ethics training to produce positive results.
4. Training should also deal with the ethical aspects of favoritism since a high percentage of employees (70%) express concern about this issue. While less concern was expressed about misuse of public property and conflicts of interest (47% and 50% respectively), the percentages are still significant and, therefore, these issues merit attention during training.

<u>Community Number</u> <u>Responding</u>	<u>Composite 565</u>		<u>East Chicago</u> <u>218</u>	
	Trained 155	U/T 410	Trained 12	U/T 206
Question				
1. Percent aware of the Ethics Code	78	43	83	27
2. Percent trained on ethics in last 12 months			6	94
3. Percent saying ethics training is important or very important	67	67	83	77
4. Percent who witnessed unethical behavior in the last 12 months	38	49	25	47
5. Percent who know how to report unethical behavior	77	41	64	35
6. Percent who asked for advice on ethics	22	18	25	18
7. Percent who have reported unethical behavior	21	23	42	26
8. Percent who would report such behavior	83	77	92	81
9. Percent who felt corrective action would be taken	72	53	67	57

Community Number Responding	Composite 565		East Chicago 218	
	Trained 155	U/T 410	Trained 12	U/T 206
10. Percent who felt action would be fair and appropriate	65	45	58	48
11. Ethics Issues of concern:				
● Misuse of public resource	53	43	58	47
● Conflicts of Interest	53	65	50	70
● Favoritism	42	49	50	50
● Other	11	17	17	20

2012
Highland Report

Several survey responses from Highland employees are similar to the Composite numbers. However, in some important respects, Highland employee responses deviate negatively from the Composite and in some cases these differences are significant. The Composite figures aggregate responses from all seven communities that participated in the survey and provide a basis for comparison to Highland's results. See attached chart.

Altogether only 45 Highland employees responded to the survey. The low response may have skewed some of the results. Here are some observations about Highland employee responses:

1. Highland employees rated ethics training slightly less favorably than the Composite grouping. (Composite trained/untrained – 67/67; Highland trained/untrained – 64/60) It is not clear why this might be, but in any case, the next round of ethics training should give particular attention to presentation quality and workforce relevance.
2. Only 33% of Highland employees have received ethics training in the past 12 months. We urge the Town to find an opportunity in the very near future to repeat ethics training for every full time employee.
3. A much higher percentage of Highland employees – both trained and untrained – report witnessing unethical behavior. (Composite trained/untrained 38%/49%; Highland – 60%/60%). In addition, trained Highland employees are less likely to know the procedure for filing complaints (Composite trained 77%; Highland trained 67%).
4. On the other hand, Highland trained and untrained employees say they are more likely to have reported unethical behavior compared to the Composite group (Composite 21%/23% and Highland 47%/37%). Similarly, a very high percentage say they would report unethical behavior if they were to see it (Composite 83%/77%; Highland 87%/90%). However, Highland's numbers drop below the Composite grouping when Highland employees were asked if action would be taken in response to a complaint (Composite 72%/53%; Highland 67%/43%) and if that action would be fair and appropriate (Composite 65%/45%; Highland 53%/38%). Taken as a whole, this group of responses is perplexing. A high percentage of both trained and untrained Highland employees say they have or would report violations, but they have a lower confidence in an appropriate outcome.
5. Highland employees expressed greater concern about favoritism (Trained 73%, Untrained 67%) compared to the Composite figures (53%/65%). Conflicts of interest and misuse of public resources also concerned a substantial number of respondents and on both issues exceeded the Composite percentages.

Highland 2012 Compared to 2009

On four important questions, Highland percentages improved or held to a high place in the 2012 survey compared to 2009.

- The percentage of responses from both trained and untrained employees saying they are aware of the Code of Shared Ethics and Values improved significantly in 2012 (trained 73%; untrained 63%) compared to the 2009 survey (59%/52% respectively).
- There was some increase in trained employees feeling that ethics training is important or very important (64% in 2012; 61% in 2009). Even so, Highland's trained employees' responses are below the Composite group.
- Increases are noted among trained and especially untrained employees on how to report unethical behavior. Trained: 2012-67%; 2009-63%. Untrained: 2012-57%; untrained 2009-10%.
- Employees saying they would report unethical behavior were very high in 2009 (trained 88%; untrained 89%) and they remained about the same in 2012 (87% and 90% respectively). Highland percentages were and are higher than the 2012 Composite.

The following questions produced lower percentages in 2012 than 2009, but this may be a positive if these responses indicate that trained employees (and even untrained by virtue of evolving culture) have a more sophisticated understanding of ethics and what constitutes an ethics violation.

- Trained employees said they witnessed less unethical behavior in 2012 compared to 2009 (60% and 70% respectively). However, untrained employees responded in the opposite direction (60% in 2012; 53% in 2009). This result may indicate training gives employees a finer understanding of unethical behavior. In any case, for both trained and untrained employees, the percentage saying yes to this question is relatively high.
- There was a dramatic decline in “yes” responses from **trained** employees (52 percent in 2009 and 27 percent in 2012) when responding if they had asked supervisors for advice on ethics issues, not too far from the Composite group, perhaps indicating that they feel confident enough to address the issue on their own. Percentages of **untrained** employees moved in the opposite direction -- 27 percent in 2012, compared to 17 percent in 2009.
- With respect to whether the employee actually reported an alleged violation, among the **trained**, the 2012 percentage was 47% compared to 52% in 2009, but as in several other questions, a higher percentage of **untrained** said they reported unethical behavior – 37% in 2012, 20% in 2009. It's not apparent why the untrained percentages are moving in the opposite direction of trained. Whatever the reason, effective training of **all** Highland employees might help clarify the situation.

Responses on enforcement issues raise concerns that cannot be fully answered from survey data:

- In addressing the questions about whether a complaint would produce corrective action, 67 percent of **trained** employees said “yes” on the 2012 survey compared to 64 percent in 2009; so a modest

improvement but still less than the 2012 Composite which was 72%. Among the **untrained**, there was a strong reversal – 43 percent saying “yes” in 2012 compared to 59 percent in 2009.

- Similarly with the related question asking whether corrective action would be fair and appropriate – improvement between 2012 and 2009 among **trained** employees –53 percent “yes” in 2012 compared to 48 percent in 2009. Once again, the **untrained** moved in the opposite direction – 38 percent in 2012 and 54 percent in 2009. It’s almost as if there are two Highland workforces moving in opposite directions on important ethics issues. Universal training should help correct this trend.

With respect to misuse of public resources, favoritism and conflicts of interest, significantly higher percentages of trained employees expressed concerns about all three of these issues in 2012 compared to 2009. Untrained employees were close to the 2009 result for misuse and favoritism. Concern about conflicts among the untrained declined significantly to 50 percent in 2012 compared to 74 percent in 2009.

Recommendations

1. Percentages have often improved since 2009 but also in many cases remain below the 2012 Composite.
2. Highland’s results are somewhat perplexing. Trained employees and untrained employees seem to be moving in opposite directions when 2012 responses are compared to 2009.
3. Several responses indicate ethics training may have a credibility problem. Perhaps many employees feel the training isn’t relevant or isn’t followed through in practice.
4. Still most Highland respondents say ethics training is important. Perhaps the length of time since the last training has caused some loss of momentum.
5. We recommend that additional ethics training should be scheduled for every town employee and that some of the issues highlighted in survey results be addressed directly, including respondent’s concerns about enforcement follow-through, favoritism and misuse of public resources. With respect to conflicts, while the responses improved compared to 2009, the 2012 yes responses were considerably above the Composite group. Training should help clarify these issues for all employees. Sometimes uninformed perception sees conflicts and other problems when they do not actually exist.
6. Future training should also provide specific information about Highland’s procedure for filing a complaint.
7. Since the limited number of respondents may have provided misleading results, the Commission asks the Town to consider re-polling employees after another round of ethics training.

Community Number Responding	2012 Composite 565		2012 Highland 45		2009 Highland 59	
	Trained 155	U/T 410	Trained 30	U/ T 15	Trained 27	U/ T 32
1. Percent aware of the Ethics Code	78	43	73	63	59	52
2. Percent trained on ethics in last 12 months			33	67	47	53
3. Percent saying ethics training is important or very important	67	67	64	60	61	61
4. Percent who witnessed unethical behavior in the last 12 months	38	49	60	60	70	53
5. Percent who know how to report unethical behavior	77	41	67	57	63	10
6. Percent who asked for advice on ethics	22	18	27	27	52	17
7. Percent who have reported unethical behavior	21	23	47	37	52	20
8. Percent who would report such behavior	83	77	87	90	88	89
9. Percent who felt corrective action would be taken	72	53	67	43	64	59

Community Number Responding	2012 Composite 565		2012 Highland 45		2009 Highland 59	
	Trained 155	U/T 410	Trained 30	U/ T 15		
10. Percent who felt action would be fair and appropriate	65	45	53	38	48	54
11. Ethics Issues of concern:						
• Misuse of public resource	53	43	67	43	41	48
• Conflicts of Interest	53	65	73	67	55	70
• Favoritism	42	49	60	50	50	74
• Other	11	17	13	27	23	15

Munster Report – 2012

In most categories Munster survey results were close to, and in some cases exceeded, the Composite figures. The Composite report aggregates responses from all seven member communities that participated in the survey and provides a basis for comparison. Altogether 53 Munster employees responded. Some observations:

1. A very high percentage of trained and untrained employees said ethics training is important or very important – 75 percent compared to 67 percent for the Composite grouping.
2. There are variances (often significant) in responses of Munster trained employees compared to untrained, which may indicate that Munster’s training is effective in addressing these issues, but also highlights the need to promptly train the untrained.
3. On several questions, responses of Munster **trained** employees came close to the trained Composite group, and in several cases exceeded the Composite group. However, for three of the four questions reported below, Munster **untrained** employees were below the Composite untrained.
 - Know how to report alleged unethical behavior – trained 75% (Composite 77%); untrained 50% (Composite 41%)
 - Would report unethical behavior – trained 80% (Composite 83%); untrained 66% (Composite 77%)
 - Belief that corrective action would be taken – trained 90% (Composite 72%); untrained 40% (Composite 53%)
 - Felt that corrective action would be fair and appropriate – trained 74% (Composite 65%); untrained 30% (Composite 45%)
4. Fewer **trained** Munster respondents said they had sought advice on ethics issues (10% compared to Composite of 22%). However, among the **untrained**, the relationship was reversed (34% compared to 18% for the Composite grouping).
5. Thirty percent of trained employees said they witnessed unethical behavior compared to 38% in the trained Composite group, but among the untrained employees a higher percentage (63%) said they witnessed what they felt was unethical behavior. For the Composite group, the percentage was much lower at 49 percent. Perhaps training would help employees understand that an ethics violation is something more than just not liking the outcome.
6. The perception of misuse of public resources, favoritism and conflicts is slightly lower for **trained** Munster employees compared to trained Composite. The opposite is true for **untrained** where the percentages are much higher than the Composite untrained. See attached chart.

Munster 2012 Compared to 2009

Several Munster percentages improved or held their own in 2012 compared to responses provided by town employees in 2009.

- Both trained and untrained employees continue to value ethics training (2012-trained 75%, untrained also 75% and 2009 57%/57% respectively).
- An increased percentage of trained employees said they would report unethical behavior (80% in 2012; 76% 2009).
- Both trained and untrained employees showed significant percentage increases in answering if they know how to report alleged violations – 2012 trained 75%; 2009 trained 69%. For untrained the breakdown is 50% for 2012 and only 33% in 2009.
- Enforcement is currently highly regarded by **trained** Munster employees – 90 percent saying they felt corrective action would be taken if a complaint were filed compared to just 67 percent in 2009. For the related question – would the corrective action be fair and appropriate, the positive response also saw a significant improvement compared to 2009 (trained employees: 74% in 2012; 65% in 2009). In both enforcement questions, positive responses from trained employees significantly exceeded 2012 Composite percentage. For the **untrained**, the percentages decline from 2009 to 2012.

Other percentages declined between 2009 and 2012, but for these questions, a decline may be a positive.

- The percent of trained employees who said they saw unethical behavior declined from 67% in 2009 to 30% in 2012.
- Asking for advice from a supervisor declined among employees who said they were trained -- 49% in 2009 to 10% in 2012. Perhaps, trained employees now have a deep enough understanding of ethical issues to answer questions on their own.
- The results were the same for trained employees who said they actually reported ethics violations: 36% in 2009 and 20% in 2012, possibly indicating that trained employees may see fewer violations to report because they have a better understanding of what constitutes a violation.

Despite these many positions, there are a few areas of significant concern:

- Among trained Munster employees' awareness of the Code of Shared Ethics and Values has declined significantly since the 2009 survey. In 2009, 82 percent of the trained and 47 percent of untrained employees said they were aware of the Code. By 2012, those percentages dropped to 60 percent for the trained, though surprisingly, awareness increased significantly for the untrained rising from 47 percent in 2009 to 63 percent in 2012.

- In the 2012 survey, 62 percent of Munster employees said they had not been trained. In 2009, the percentage was only 25%. Even though the 2012 question was limited to a twelve month time frame and the 2009 questions was not time limited, the 2012 result suggests that all employees should be trained or retrained promptly.
- Several of the questions discussed at the beginning of this section showed trained Munster employees improving their percentages in 2012 compared to 2009. This is encouraging, but among untrained employees the percentage of favorable responses in several of the questions has dropped from 2009 to 2012. Untrained employees are less informed and more concerned than they were in 2009 on questions such as witnessing unethical behavior, (which they say has increased), willingness to report ethical violations, confidence that corrective action would be taken and that when taken whether it would be fair and appropriate. It is not apparent why so many areas have untrained employees seeing the state of ethics less positively in 2012 compared to 2009. Whatever the reason(s), comprehensive ethics training for every employee should help to get all Munster employees moving in the same direction.

Recommendations

1. Only 38 percent of the respondents said they had been trained during the past 12 months. The Commission urges Munster to provide another round of ethics training to every employee in the near future.
2. As noted above, **trained** Munster respondents (compared to the Composite grouping) seemed to have a significantly higher percentage belief that action will be taken and that the action will be fair and appropriate (Enforcement Issues). But when comparing **untrained** Munster employees to the Composite on Enforcement Issues the relationship is reversed, with the untrained Composite expressing greater confidence in outcomes than Munster's untrained. On the question whether action would be taken: Composite untrained - 53%, Munster untrained - 40%. Action would be fair and appropriate: Composite untrained 45%, Munster untrained - 30%. Comparing 2012 to 2009, Munster untrained also shows declines while trained percentages increased.
3. From the previous paragraph, it is reasonable to conclude that training increases confidence that appropriate enforcement will occur and this confidence endures at least for a period of time. Conversely, the lack of training causes an erosion of confidence in enforcement and this loss increases over time. Frequent training helps reinforce the continuing importance of ethics issues.
4. Comparing 2009 and 2012 responses also shows that the untrained are less informed and less positive about ethical practices than their ethics-trained co-workers. This dichotomy seems serious, but curable by universal training.
5. While improvement is noted in trained and untrained employee attitudes about misuse of public resources, favoritism and conflicts of interest, concerns persist among a substantial percentage of respondents and training should address these concerns.
6. The significant differences in responses between trained and untrained employees may be an indication of the value of training in Munster. Perhaps Munster employees are particularly receptive to ethics

training; perhaps the quality of instruction is good; maybe a combination of both or other factors produce very positive results among the trained. Meanwhile the untrained seemed to be more adrift.

7. These results argue for providing training to the untrained. So as not to lose the positive impact of training, previously trained employees should be given additional training. Training seems to have a strong imprint on Munster employees. The Commission hopes that **every** Munster employee can be trained or retrained promptly.

<u>Community Number Responding</u>	<u>2012 Composite 565</u>		<u>2012 Munster 53</u>		<u>2009 Munster 60</u>	
	Trained 155	U/T 410	Trained 21	U/ T 32	Traine d 45	U/ T 15
1. Percent aware of the Ethics Code	78	43	60	63	82	47
2. Percent trained on ethics in last 12 months	--	--	38	62	75	25
3. Percent saying ethics training is important or very important	67	67	75	75	57	57
4. Percent who witnessed unethical behavior in the last 12 months	38	49	30	63	67	53
5. Percent who know how to report unethical behavior	77	41	75	50	69	33
6. Percent who asked for advice on ethics	22	18	10	34	49	20
7. Percent who have reported unethical behavior	21	23	20	28	36	27
8. Percent who would report such behavior	83	77	80	66	76	75
9. Percent who felt corrective action would be taken	72	53	90	40	67	62

Community Number Responding	2012 Composite 565		2012 Munster 53		2009 Munster 60	
	Trained 155	U/T 410	Trained 21	U/ T 32	Traine d 45	U/T 15
10. Percent who felt action would be fair and appropriate	65	45	74	30	65	53
11. Ethics Issues of concern:						
• Misuse of public resource	53	43	40	47	51	62
• Conflicts of Interest	53	65	55	78	74	92
• Favoritism	42	49	40	59	46	62
• Other	11	17	10	19	13	23

2012
Schererville Report

In nearly every category, Schererville employees equaled or exceeded (in some cases significantly exceeded) the results of the Composite grouping. The Composite figures represent an aggregation of responses from all seven communities that participated in the survey. However, only 42 employees responded and this relatively low response rate may have skewed the results. Nevertheless, Schererville is to be complimented for the positive results among trained employees. Some observations about Schererville's response in comparison to the Composite group are set out below:

1. **Trained** Schererville employees exceeded the Composite group in several important ways.
 - Awareness of the Code of Shared Ethics and Values – Schererville's trained employees 88%; Composite's trained 78%.
 - Importance of ethics training – Schererville's trained 74%; Composite's trained 67%.
 - Knowledge of procedure for reporting unethical behavior – Schererville's trained 88%; Composite's trained 77%.
 - Have reported unethical behavior – Schererville's trained 33%; Composite's trained 21%.
 - Would report if saw unethical behavior – Schererville's trained an astonishing 100%; Composite's 83%.
2. **Untrained** employees had much lower percentages than their ethics trained colleagues, as would be expected. However in most cases, Schererville's untrained employees had lower percentages than the Composite's untrained. Perhaps this suggests a pressing need to train the untrained. Based on the survey results, it is reasonable to say that (a) Schererville training has been effective and (b) untrained employees would likely benefit from this training in a similar manner.
3. With respect to enforcement issues, Schererville's trained employees tracked closely with the Composite. In answering whether action would be taken if a complaint were filed, 71 percent of Schererville trained said yes compared to 72 percent of Composite. With respect to feeling that the action would be fair and appropriate, 62 percent of Schererville trained respondents said yes compared to Composite trained at 65 percent. Untrained Schererville respondents exceeded the Composite in both responses.
4. Both trained and untrained employees expressed concern about favoritism and to a lesser extent conflicts of interest. In both cases, Schererville percentages were similar to the Composite group though still significant. With respect to misuse of public resources, trained employees to a greater extent than the Composite group (63%/53%) indicated concern. At the same time, untrained expressed a slightly lower rate of concern about that issue than the Composite group (40%/43%).

Schererville 2012 Compared to 2009

1. As with the comparison to the Composite group, Schererville shows very positive results when their 2012 survey responses are compared to their 2009 survey, especially for trained employees.
 - Awareness of the Code of Shared Ethics and Values among trained employees rose from 26% in the 2009 survey to 88% in 2012. Percentages for untrained employees barely changed between the two surveys (36% in 2012 and 38% in 2009).
 - Both trained and untrained employees in both time periods said ethics training is important. For the trained the improvement in the 2012 survey is dramatic – 74% in 2012 compared to 58% in 2009. For untrained employees, there was little change – 60% in 2012; 58% in 2009.
 - Knowledge of how to file a complaint rose among the trained to 88% in 2012 compared to 63% in 2009, though there was a slight decline on the part of the untrained – 32% in 2012 from 36% in 2009.
 - In answering whether they would report unethical behavior if they saw it, an amazing 100 percent of the trained employees said they would (compared to 77% in the 2009 survey). Likewise, a high percentage of untrained (74% in 2012, 77% in 2009) said they also would report such behavior.

2. For some questions, declining percentages in 2012 compared to 2009 may be a positive if the 2012 responses can be interpreted as reflecting greater awareness and understanding of ethics issues and/or general improvement in the ethics culture in Schererville.
 - Both trained and untrained employees reported lower percentages in answering whether they had witnessed unethical behavior. Trained: 31% in 2012; 53% in 2009. Untrained: 40% in 2012; 68% in 2009.
 - Only 25 percent of trained employees said they asked a supervisor for advice on ethics in the 2012 survey while in 2009, the percentage was much higher (47%). Untrained also showed a similar trend – 20% in 2012 and 39% in 2009.
 - Percent of trained and untrained employees responding that they actually reported unethical behavior declined significantly. Trained 33% in 2012; 41% in 2009. Untrained 8% in 2012; 33% in 2009. As noted earlier, 100% of Schererville trained said they would report an infraction if they saw it which supports the notion that the decline in actual reports of infractions is a positive.
 - The percentages declined from 2012 to 2009 when employees were asked to express their concerns about misuse of public resources, favoritism and conflicts of interest. This was true for both trained and untrained employees. While the trend is encouraging, the responses still indicate that even in 2012 a significant number of employees are concerned about these issues.

3. While there has been some improvement in the percentage of employees saying they had been trained in the past twelve months compared to 2009 responses, the most important point is that more than half of Schererville's employees continue to report that they have not received recent ethics training. Considering the apparent positive responses from employees who have been trained, a high priority should be given to training everyone.
4. Another important challenge in the Schererville numbers comes from the two related questions on enforcement. While the percentages are still high, there are significant declines in the responses of both trained and untrained employees to the questions of whether a reported violation would produce corrective action (trained: 2012-71%; 2009-82%; untrained: 2012-65%; 2009-72%). And the pattern is similar with the second enforcement question—would whatever action that is taken be fair and appropriate. Trained: 2012-62%, 2009-77%; Untrained: 2012-50%, 2009-67%.

Recommendations

1. The Commission recommends that the Town review its procedure for distributing the employee survey so that next time the survey is taken, the Schererville response rate will be higher.
2. The survey seems to indicate that training has a positive impact on those trained. The high scores of the trained and the relatively low scores of the untrained suggest that further training should occur soon and should also be as inclusive as possible.
3. Training should address the decline in employee confidence that corrective action will be taken when ethics violations are found. While Schererville employees still give high marks to enforcement practices, the sharp decline from 2009 to 2012 may be a warning sign. Further training should give additional focus to these issues.
4. While progress has been made on employee concerns about misuse of public resources, favoritism and conflicts of interest, especially compared to the 2009 survey, a significant number of both trained and untrained employees still express concern about these issues. Consequently, greater attention to these issues during training should produce further positive results.

<u>Community Number</u> <u>Responding</u>	<u>2012</u> <u>Composite 565</u>		<u>2012</u> <u>Schererville 42</u>		<u>2009</u> <u>Schererville 69</u>	
	Trained 155	U/T 410	Trained 17	U/T 25	Trained 19	U/T 50
Question						
1. Percent aware of the Ethics Code	78	43	88	36	26	38
2. Percent trained on ethics in last 12 months			39	61	28	72
3. Percent saying ethics training is important or very important	67	67	74	60	58	58
4. Percent who witnessed unethical behavior in the last 12 months	38	49	31	40	53	68
5. Percent who know how to report unethical behavior	77	41	88	32	63	36
6. Percent who asked for advice on ethics	22	18	25	20	47	39
7. Percent who have reported unethical behavior	21	23	33	8	41	33
8. Percent who would report such behavior	83	77	100	74	77	77
9. Percent who felt corrective action would be taken	72	53	71	65	82	72

Community Number Responding	2012 Composite 565		2012 Schererville 42		2009 Schererville 69	
	Trained 155	U/T 410	Trained 17	U/T 25	Trained 19	U/T 50
10. Percent who felt action would be fair and appropriate	65	45	62	50	77	67
11. Ethics Issues of concern:						
• Misuse of public resource	53	43	63	40	70	50
• Conflicts of Interest	53	65	56	60	60	65
• Favoritism	42	49	44	40	60	53
• Other	11	17	19	16	10	15

Whiting Report – 2012

In several categories, survey results for Whiting employees exceeded (and in some cases significantly exceeded) the results of the Composite grouping. And Whiting also had a very high response rate with 65 employees returning survey forms. The attached chart shows how Whiting's responses compare to the Composite group, which represents an aggregation of responses from all seven communities that participated in the survey. Some observations:

1. Whiting employees and leadership are to be commended for the high rate of survey responses, the highest response in terms of percent of employees responding compared to total employers.
2. **Trained** Whiting employees exceeded the Composite group in several important ways:
 - Aware of the Code of Shared Ethics and Values – Whiting trained 88%; Composite trained 78%
 - Know procedures for reporting unethical behavior – Whiting trained 90%; Composite trained 77%
 - Ask for advice on ethics – Whiting trained 29%; Composite trained 22%
 - Believe that corrective action would be taken if unethical behavior is reported – Whiting trained 78%; Composite trained 72%
 - Believe that corrective action will be fair and appropriate – Whiting trained 78%; Composite trained 65%
3. As would be expected, **untrained** Whiting employees had lower scores than their trained colleagues. However, it is encouraging to note the Whiting untrained employees also exceeded the scores of the Composite untrained in all but two of these areas. The response of Whiting's trained and untrained indicates existence of a strong ethical environment in this community.
4. Even in Whiting's positive atmosphere, many employees, trained and untrained, express concerns about misuse of public resources, conflicts of interest and to a lesser extent favoritism. But it also should be noted that Whiting employees' concerns about these issues, while significant, are no greater and generally much less than the Composite group.

Whiting 2012 Compared to 2009

1. Whiting employee responses show significant increases in the percentage of employees giving positive answers in 2012 compared to 2009 for the following issues:
 - The percentage of employees who said they have had ethics training has increased from 29 percent in 2009 to 65 percent in 2012, the highest of any member community. However that means 35% still need to be trained.
 - Concerns expressed about misuse of public resources and conflicts of interest dropped significantly among both trained and untrained employees. Misuse of Public Resources: Trained 54% in 2012 and 80% in 2009. Untrained 23% in 2012 and 53% in 2009. Conflicts: Trained 32% in 2012 and 60% in 2009. With respect to favoritism, there was a slight increase among

trained employees – 46% in 2012 compared to 40% in 2009. Among untrained employees, the percent expressing concern about favoritism actually declined—55% in 2012 and 73% in 2009.

2. Another group of questions produced lower percentages in 2012 than 2009, but these declines are probably positive for the cause of ethics in government.
 - The percentage of employees who said they witnessed unethical behavior was 32 percent in 2012 whereas it was 69 percent in 2009. The percentage also dropped for untrained employees 46 percent in 2012 compared to 69 percent in 2009.
 - A much smaller percentage of both trained and untrained employees reported seeking advice on ethics issues from their supervisors. Trained -- 29% in 2012 and 47% in 2009. Untrained -- 9% in 2012 and 23% in 2009. For trained employees, a possible explanation is that training has made it possible for employees to answer their own questions or they felt comfortable asking knowledgeable co-workers rather than supervisors. Then too, as already noted, employees reported seeing less unethical behavior and thus there was less need to discuss concerns with others. The decline in the percentage of untrained employees who sought advice may also be because there were fewer ethical infractions. Another way of phrasing it might be that an ethics culture is developing among the Whiting workforce.
 - Consistent with the declines in seeing violations or asking for advice, the percentage of employees who say they have actually reported ethics violations has also declined dramatically. Trained – only 2% in 2012 and 25% in 2009. Untrained – 18% in 2012 and 32% in 2009.
3. In several areas Whiting employees held to 2009 levels. This is not a negative because the 2009 responses were very high and holding those high percentages in 2012 is an accomplishment.
 - Awareness of the Code of Shared Ethics and Values – trained 88 percent in both 2012 and 2009. Untrained employees showed a very large increase – 71 percent were aware of the Code in 2012 compared to 18 percent in 2009 (another indication that an ethics culture may be developing among Whiting employees).
 - Knowing how to file a complaint presents a similar pattern – holding to high percentage for trained employees (90% in 2012 and 94% in 2009) while untrained reported an increased percentage saying they know how to file complaints (55% in 2012 and 21% in 2009).
 - For employees saying they would report ethics violations, the pattern repeats itself but with just a slight slippage in the trained employees' percentage. Trained: 76% in 2012 and 81% in 2009. Untrained: 80% in 2012 and 71% in 2009.
4. As positive as Whiting result are, there are still at least two potential challenges:
 - Percentages of both trained and untrained employees declined for the question which asked employees to rate the importance of ethics training. Trained 63% in 2012 but 72% in 2009. Untrained: 66% in 2012 but 72% in 2009. These declines may indicate that employees have come to believe Whiting's ethics climate is good, that additional training is not necessary and that an ethics climate is self-sustaining. However, we note these declines as a warning sign that

complacency may set in. Experience with other member communities strongly suggests that frequent training is needed to sustain a positive ethics environment.

- Similarly, when asked if corrective action would be fair and appropriate, the percentage of trained employees who said yes declined (78% in 2012 but 88% in 2009. Untrained improved slightly – 55% in 2012 and 53% in 2009). While these results are still among the highest in member communities, possible further erosion is a risk that needs attention.

Recommendations

1. Keep doing what you have been doing. It seems to be working.
2. Since several employees continue to express concern about misuse of public resources, conflicts of interest and favoritism, future training sessions should give added focus to these issues.
3. It may be appropriate to review the City's procedure for responding to complaints since there seems to be some slippage in employee confidence that corrective action will be fair and appropriate. (However, it should be noted that, even the reduced positive percentage reported in 2012 compared to 2009, still places Whiting among the highest of our member communities).
4. To keep the positive momentum going, across the board ethics training should be scheduled again in the near future.

<u>Community Number Responding</u>	<u>2012 Composite 565</u>		<u>2012 Whiting 65</u>		<u>2009 Whiting 55</u>	
	Trained 155	U/T 410	Trained 42	U/ T 23	Trained 16	U/ T 39
1. Percent aware of the Ethics Code	78	43	88	71	88	18
2. Percent trained on ethics in last 12 months			65	35	29	71
3. Percent saying ethics training is important or very important	67	67	63	66	72	72
4. Percent who witnessed unethical behavior in the last 12 months	38	49	32	46	69	69
5. Percent who know how to report unethical behavior	77	41	90	55	94	21
6. Percent who asked for advice on ethics	22	18	29	9	47	23
7. Percent who have reported unethical behavior	21	23	2	18	25	32
8. Percent who would report such behavior	83	77	76	80	81	77
9. Percent who felt corrective action would be taken	72	53	78	59		

Community Number Responding	2012 Composite 565		2012 Whiting 65		2009 Whiting 55	
	Trained 155	U/T 410	Trained 42	U/ T 23	Trained 16	U/ T 39
10. Percent who felt action would be fair and appropriate	65	45	78	55	88	53
11. Ethics Issues of concern:						
• Misuse of public resource	53	43	54	23	80	53
• Conflicts of Interest	53	65	46	55	40	73
• Favoritism	42	49	32	36	60	53
• Other	11	17	2	14	0	7

KD_SHEC(1)

